## Communication with Extraterrestrial Intelligence ${ }^{1}$ <br> BY LAMBROS D. CALİIMAHOS <br> Unclassified.

We are not alone in the universe. A few years ago, this notion seemed farfetched; today, the existence of eitraterrestrial intelligence is taken for granted by most scientists. Sir Bernard Lovell, one of the world's leading radio astronomers, has calculated that, even allowing for a margin of error of $5000 \%$, there must be in our own galayy about 100 million stars which have planets of the right chemistry, dimensions, and temperature to support organic evolution. If we consider that our own galary, the Milky Way, is but one of at least a billion other galadies similar to ours in the observable universe, the number of stars that could support some form of life is, to reach for a word, astronomical. As to advanced (by miserable earth standards) forms of life, Dr. Frank D. Drake of the National Radio Astronomy Observatory at Green Bank, West Virginia, has stated that, purting all our knowledge together, the number of civilizations which could have arisen by now is about one billion. The next question is, "Where is everybody?"
The nearest neighbor to our solar system is Alpha Centauri, oniy 4.3 light years away; but, according to Dr. Su-Shu Hueng of the National Aeronautics and Space Administration, its planetary system is probably toc young for the emergence of life. Two other heavenly friends, Epsilon Eridani and Tau Ceti, about 11 light years away, are stronger contenders for harboring life. Nevertheless, if superior civilizations are abundant, the nearest would probably be at least 100 light years away; therefore, it would take 200 years for a reply to be forthcoming, a sinall matter of seven generations. This should, however, make little diference to us, in view of the enormous potentiel gain from our contact with a superior civilization. Unless we're terribly conceited (a very unscientific demeanor), we must assume that the "others" are far more advanced than we are." Even a 50 -year gap would be tremendous; a $\mathbf{5 0 0}$-year gap.staggers the imagination, and as

[^0]for a 5000 -year gap.... (By the way, if they are as much as 50 years behind us, forget it!). It is quite possible that "others". have satellite probes in space, retransmitting to "them". anything that sounds nonrandom to the probe. But they have probably called us several thousand years ago, and are waiting for an answer, or worse yet, they have given up; or, more probably, they have reached such impressive technological advances that they have destroyed themselves.?

Epsilon Eridani and Tau Ceti were the targets on which Dr. Drake focussed his attention in the spring of 1960 in Project Oima a an attempt to detect possible intelligent signals from outer space. The frequency selected for listening was 1420.405752 megacycles per second, or a wave length of 21 cm . This particuiar frequency, postulated independently by two professors on the faculty of Cornell University, Giuseppe Cocconi and Philip Morrison, happens to be the radiation frequency of atomic or free hydrogen which permeates space in great clouds; moreover, this frequency is within the range of radio frequencies able to pass through the earth's atmosphere. Presumably, the significance of this frequency would be known to other intelligent beings in the universe who understand radio theory. We're still talking about radio waves as the communication medium; other possible media might be masers; lasers, or the as.yet undiscovered and unnamed "rasers." A technology superior to ours might even have learned how to modulate a beam of neutrinos (weightless, uncharged particles that physicists on earth find it difficult even to detect); if so, "they" may have to wait a century or two before we learn how to build a neutrino receiver.
If another civilization were trying to establish communication with us, it would first embark on attention-getting signals of such a nature that we could distinguish them from random cosmic noise; once we receive a recognizable signal, we have a good chance of understanding the message. For example, they could start with trains of signals corresponding to the natural numbers $1,2,3, \ldots$, followed perhaps by prime numbers. They might continue with equal-length extended signals consisting of start and stopimpulses, with occasional pulses in

[^1]between; when these signals are a would show a circle, the Pythagor design. These attention-getting : "language lessons," interspersed wi - Help bring us up to the level of our s

It may be assumed that the sr possessed by all higher forms of li could thus be greatly simplined : representation such as that of a te: held at Green Bank in 1961 to disct: with other planets, one of the par: up a hypothetical message on ti consisting of 1271 binary digits or 1271 has but two prime factors, 3 : to write out the message in raster in 31 lines of 41 bits each; the latie ness in the patterns disclosed, in dimensions. In Fig. 2 is the writ binary l's have been replaced bæ a Now for its interpretation.

There are dots at the four cor points, marking the outlines of th representation of the sun; direct: representing 8 planets, identified ) their left, preceded by a binary $y$ legged beings illustrated are obvic hand of the male figure points to parently reside. At the top of thtions of̂ hydrogen, carbon, and chemical structure of life on their third planet there emerges a wavy water; the representation of a fish : and therefore have space trave!. to a six (preceded by the usual t there are six fingers on each har their number system is probably : female figure may be seen a bracke binary form (preceded by a binar. are 11 units high. A reasonable cm ., the wave length of the trans. tall, which should be all right for a

In 1952 the British mathemat: address before the British Interpl: or First Steps in Celestial Syntax.

## IAL INTELLIGENCE

, if they are as much as 50 years sible that "others" have satellite iem" anything that sounds non-.. ave probably called us several for an answer; or worse yet, they sy have-reached such impressive. $\geq$ destroyed themselves. ${ }^{2}$
the targets on which Dr. Drake ; of 1960 in Project Ozroa, an signals from outer space. The :s 1420.405752 megacycles per This particular frequency, posssors on the faculty of Cornell ilip Morrison, happens to be the hydrogen which permeates space quency is within the range of $h$ the earth's atmosphere. Preuency would be known to other inderstand radio theory. We're $\geq$ communication medium; other :, or the as yet undiscovered and perior to ours might even have leutrinos (weightless, uncharged it difficult even to detect); if so, :wo before we learn how to build
o establish communication with -yetting signals of such a nature random cosmic noise; once we a good chance of understanding ald start with trains of signals 1, 2, 3, . . , followed perhaps inue with equal-length extended Julses, with occasional pulses in

[^2]7 which can lead to excessive specializa:on.
jcial intelligent beings."

## L. D. CALLIMAHOS

UNCLASSIFIED
between; when these signals are aligned flush over one another, they would show a circle, the Pythagorean Theorem, or similar geometric design. These attention-getting signals would be followed by early "language lessons," interspersed with items of technical information to help bring us up to the level of our superiors, "them.".
It may be assumed that the sense of sight, or an equivalent, is possessed by all higher forms of life; the problems of communication could thus be greatly simplified through the medium of a "raster" representation such as that of a television screen. After a conference held at Green Bank in 1961 to discuss the possibility of communication with other planets, one of the participants, Bernard M. Oliver, made up a hypothetical message on the raster principle. The message, consisting of 1221 binary digits or "bits," is shown in Fig. 1. Since 1271 has but two prime factors, 31 and 41 , we would naturally be led to write out the message in raster form, in 41 lines of 31 bits each, or in 31 lines of 41 bits each; the latter case reveals a greater nonrandomness in the patterns disclosed, indicating that these are the correct dimensions. In Fig. 2 is the write-out of the message, in which the binary l's have been replaced by a dot and the 0's left as blank spaces. Now for its interpretation.

There are dots at the four corners of the pictogram as reference points, marking the ouriines of the rectangle. At the upper left is a representation of the sun; directly underneath in a column are dots representing 8 planets, identified by the appropriate binary coding to their left, preceded by a binary point as a marker. - The erect, twolegged beings illustrated are obviously bisexual and mammalian; one hand of the male figure points to the fourth planet where they apparenily reside. At the top of the pictogram may be seen representations of hydrogen, carbon, and oxygen atoms, indicating that the chemical structure of life on their planet is similar to ours. From the third planet there emerges a wavy line, showing that it is covered with water; the representation of a fish shows that they must have visited us and therefore have space travel. One hand of the female figure points to a șix (preceded by the usual binary point), perhaps implying that there are six fingers on each hand; we could therefore assume that their number system is probably to the base 12. At the right of the female figure may be seen a bracket, in the middle of which is eleven in binary form (preceded by a binary point): this implies that the beings are 11 units high. A reasonable interpretation is that the unit is 21 cm., the wave length of the transmission, making them about $7 \%$ feet tall, which should be all right for average Martians.

In $1955^{2}$ the British mathematician Lancelot Hogben delivered an address before the British Interplanetary Society entitled "Astraglossa, or First Steps in Celestial Syntax." Hogben pointed out that number

## UNCLASSIFIED EXTRATERRESTRIAL INTELLIGENCE

1000000000000000000000000000000000000000 10000111200000000001000001000000100000100
$\cdots 0000010001000000000000000000000000000000$ 0000001000100001000000100000000000010000 0000000100010000010000001000000001000100 010000000112000000000000010000000000001 0000000000000000000000000000000000000000 0000000000000000000000001000002000000100 0001000021000100000000001100000000000000 0000000000000000000110000110000110000110 1101201101001100001100101100101100100100 1001001001010100100100001100001100001100 $0011000-011.00000-0000100000000000111110100$ 0000000000000000000100000000000100000100 0000000001011011100100000000000001111101 0000000000000000000000000000100000000000 0000001000100111000000000000101000000000 0000001010010000110010101110010100000000 0000000101001000010000000000100100000000 0000000001001000001000000000001111100000 00000000112120000001111010100000010101000 0000000010101000000010000000000010001010 0000000010100010000000000000000001000100 1000100010011011001110110110100000100010 0010101010001000100000000000000000010001 0002001001000100010000001000000000000111 0000011111000001110000000111110100000101 0100000101200001000100000010000000000100 0001000011200001000001000001000000000010 0000100010001000100000100000110001100001 0000010001000100010000010000011000000001 1000001101100011011000001100111

Fig. 1.


Fig. 2
I. D. Cr
is thë most universal concept for intelligent beings; therefore, mati steps in extraterrestrial communi - -uould transmit pulses representin "radioglyphs" representing "+" later carried out the basic idea : shapes to represent elementary different approach was developer Mathematics at the University book entitled "Tincos: Design of "Lincos," an acronym of "lingu: munication of ideas through sym of those who have talsen the trot is too dificult. After all, the $0^{\circ}$ across to another party, whose different from our own. In othe an "inverse cryptography," or designed, not to hide meaning, 1 prehend. Cleverness on the par: factor, not reliance on ingenu cryptographer-somehow, this to make his meaning clear to the $r$ possess a cosmic equivalent of the

As an illustration of how much minimum of material, and as an e: let us consider a message I have $\dot{d}$. expect of an initial communicai shown a series of transmissions : inhabited planet, many light yes are representations for the 32 dit or distinctive pulse shapes) heard The punctuation marks are not $p$. different time lapses: adjacent s: unit) between them; a space be (2 units); commas, semicolons, an 16 units, respectively. Between reference purposes) there is a tim

The first transmission, ( 1 ), is different symbols which will be $v$ mission (2) is the clear implicatic

[^3]UNCLASSIFIED
82

RIAL INTELLIGENCE

20000000000000000000
30001000000100000100
30000000000000000000
30100000000000010000
30001000000001000100
30000010000000000001
う 0000000000000000000
 , 0001100000000000000
10000110000110000110
20101100101100100100 10001100001200001100 - 0000000000111110100 0000000000100000100
10000000000001111101 0000000100000000000 0000000101000000000 0101110010100000000 0000000100100000000 0000000001111100000 10101000000120101000 0000000000010001010 0000000000001000100 0110110100000100010 00000000000000100001 0001000000000000111 0000111110100000101 0000010000000000100 1000001000000000020 0100000110001100001 0010000011000000001 0001100111


UNCLASSIFIED
is the most universal concept for establishing communication between intelligent beings; therefore, mathematics forms the basis for the first steps in extraterrestrial communication.: He then illustrated how he could transmit pulses representing integers, and distinctive signals or "radioglyphs" representing " + ", " - ", " $=$ ", and so on Morrison later carried out the basic idea a little further, using different pulse shapes to represent elementary mathematical symbols." An entirely different approach was developed by Hañs Freudenthal, Professor of Mathematics at the University of Utrecht,-who in 1960 published a book entitled "Lincos: Design of a Language for Cosmic Intercourse." "Lincos," an acronym of "lingua cosmica," tries to establish a communication of ideas through symbolic logic, but the general consensus of those who have taken the trouble to study his book is that his planis too difficult. After all, the object of the exercise is getting ideas across to another party, whose thinking processes may be entirely different from our own. In other words, what we need to develop is an "inverse cryptography," or communication symbolism specially designed, not to hide meaning, but to be as easy as possible to comprohend. Cleverness on the part of the sender is then the important factor, not reliance on ingenuity of the recipient. The inverse cryptographer-somehow, this term doesn't sound quite right-must make his meaning clear to the recipient, even if the latter does not possess a cosmic equivalent of the Rosetta Stone. ${ }^{3}$
As an illustration of how much information could be conveyed with a minimum of material, and as an example of facile inverse cryptography, let us consider a message I have devised to be typical of what we might expect of an initial communication from outer space. In Fig. 3 is shown a series of transmissions which could have come from another inhabited planet, many light years away. The 32 arbitrary symbols are representations for the 32 difierent signals (combinations of beeps, or distinctive pulse shapes) heard on a frequency of 1420.4 megacycles. The punctuation marks are not part of the message, but here represent different time lapses: adjacent symbols are sent with a short pause ( 1 unit) between them; a space between symbols means a longer pause ( 2 units); commas, semicolons, and periods indicate pauses of 4, 8, and 16 units, respectively. Between transmissions (numbered here for reference purposes) there is a time lapse of 32 units.
The first transmission, (1), is obviously an enumeration of the 32 different symbols which will be used in the communications; in transmission (2) is the clear implication that A represents the integer 1, B

[^4]
## L．D．CALLIMAHOS

UNCLASSIFIED

 5．T．U．Y．I．I．T．2．－i，2．s．4．f．․․
－（2）AA，B：AAA，C；AAAA，d：AAAAA．E：AAAAAA．F：AAAAAAA．C：

（3）AKALB：AXAXALC：AKAXAXALD．AXALB：BXALC：CXALD． 8XCLE：ELEXC：FKDLJ：JLDKF．ELXE：XELE．
（4）CxALB：DMALC：GMELB：EYGLMB．



（7）BOCLF：DOELH：EOELN：DONLLDN．
（8）FPCLB：MPBLD：JPBLE：JPELB．

（10）QJLRA：QJOBLRB：AREMALRELEOQJ．QAMLRMA： Q ANN O ELR B ．

（12）DTA：DTE：DTE：DLD：DUE：DUf：DUG．Jテ：JuM．








（20）E EXAALIEXAX：BCEXAHLAEEKAX：
Be

 DYBLE QNUF：DYBL场。





（26）S ©
（27）Q з XQDKQHKQ\＆FXQCBVA：










Fig． 3.

## UNCLASSIFIED EXTRATERRE

the integer $2, \ldots$ ，J the integer thëre are introdūed symbols for in teaching us their mathemal addition，subtraction，multiplic：
$\cdots$－and the concept of zero；inequa roots；and definitions of $\pi$ and new to the 31 symbols recoverec most beautiful concepts in pure if they can teach us such a．com＇ be staggered by what they wili transmission．Beginning with cluster concepts are introduce． transmission（30），we now are u： pure Venerean．Furthermore， the code they are using on us thousands upon thousands of this is easily appreciated by an． the meaning of all 30 transmissit

Even right after this first mes with that planet，we shall have Fermat＇s Last Theorem，Golc． unsolved problems in mathem： not be dificult for＂them＂to $d$ nological superiority（first of ： able to call us！）．If＂they＂$b$ ． structure constant，＂they are a： five for sure，suspect the sixth， ratio，among others，of the spec electron；it may take a century And after we resolve our pres appropriate to－make discreet harmony and peace with our fe： otherwise ingested by the su： fortune to contact us．But as （and generations of his descend：

[^5]```
Y. O. P. Q. R. S. T. U. Y. M. X. Y. z.
F. с. %. I. J. K. L. %. N. O. P. Q. R.
`.
.E:AANAAA.F:AA&AAAA. G:
I:AAA-A A A AA&AF-J.-
.LD. 左仅LB:BKALC:CXALD.* =
KF.ELKE:KELE. -
C&B.
&N}
&&. JKJLEN:JKJRJLCN:
YL mi.
i s.
- श dN%.
ELEEOQj. Q 人NNLRMA:
CCSEKA;EKASDKC.
F: DUG.JFI: JUM.
c.
Ex^##Od工LsOF.
:^XY3L3E.
2c:E. ral K「xzEL\varepsilon.
:% ミ.
C C.BO2 L i3k; H - L DNCEN
v Eremarm.
```



```
: E ;:Ax:
```


©NAF：COLLAB．








!. © ©NI
c 3 : 13.
U
; : e @in f. © @inc j.


UNCLASSIFIED．

## UNCLASSIFIED EXTRATERRESTRIAL INTELLIGENGE

the integer $2, \ldots, \mathrm{~J}$ the integer 10 ．In the first twenty transmissions there are introduced symbols for the introductory expository treatment in teaching us their mathematics．Among the items treated are： addition，subtraction，multiplication，and division；decimal notation and the concept of zero；inequalities and approximation；powers and roots；and definitions of $x$ and e．Transmission（21）adds nothing new to the 31 symbols recovered thus far，but it does quote one of the most beautiful concepts in pure mathematics：they are telling us that， if they can teach us such a complex notionat this early stage，we will be staggered by what they will teach us by the 200th or the 2000 th transmission．Beginning with transmission（22），words and word－ cluster concepts are introduced，so that by the time we come to transmission（30），we now are understanding，in a manner of speaking， pure Venerean．Furthermore，we can now see how we could recover the code they are using on us，and which will obviously consist of thousands upon thousands of code groups with different meanings； this is easily appreciated by anyone who takes the trouble to fathom the meaning of all 30 transmissions in the foregoing example．${ }^{\text {．}}$

Even right after this first message，if we are in direct communication with that planet，we shall have questions to put to＂them＂：the prooi of Fermat＇s Last Theorem，Goldbach＇s conjecture，${ }^{3}$ and many orher unsolved problems in mathematics and the natural sciences．It wiil not be difficult for＂them＂to demonstrate their intellectual and tech－ nological superiority（first of all，don＇t forget it was they who were able to call us！）．If＂they＂but know the secenth digit of the＂fine structure constant，＂they are ages ahead of us（we know only the first five for sure，suspect the sixth）．This number， $137.039 \ldots$ ，is the ratio，among others，of the speed of light to the speed of the hydirogen electron；it may take a century to calculate this constant to 9 disits． And after we resolve our pressing scientific questions，it might be appropriate to make discreet inquiries as to how we could live in harmony and peace with our fellow man－that is，if we aren＇t earen or otherwise ingested by the superior civilization that had the good fortune to contact us．But as far as the cryptologist is concerned，he （and generations of his descendants who might experience the supreme

[^6]UNCLASSIFIED
$\overline{8} \overline{5}$
L. D. CALLIMAHOS
thrill of their lives when wè hear from "them") must keep a level head, not get excited, and be prepared to cope with problems the liike of =which he has never seen--out of this world, so to speak.

## Electronir

## INTRODUCTION

Calligraphy, the art of prode familiar term in the English lan: letters in its alphabet, English $Y$ manual or mechanical. Slight tions have little effect on legib texts are easily obtained cure to All that is necessary is a unique: it is a typewriter key or a cor English requires only that a sig letter. The Morse and Baudot sult of.such transmissions is eas

Generally speahing, most alp: graphic problems. However, st graphic in nature. Such langu: sent some idea or thing. Altho rules of formation, the number often very large. For exampl thousand unique ideographs. I: as a single element. The follow: lar symbols with very dissimilar r

Character


Therefore, : for these languages, tention in order to obtain intelli


## Fermat＇s Last Theorem：




Goldbach＇s Conjecture：






[^0]:    'The substance of this arricle was presented at a panel discussion oi the same citle during the 1 Sojs IEEE Conference on Military Electronics heid in Washington, D. C., on 23 September 1965. Besides the author as cryptologist, the other members of the panel were Dr. Paul Garvin, linguist; Dr. John C. Lilly, delphinologist; Dr. Williana O. Davis, physicist; and Fr. Francis J. Heyden, S. J., astronomer. .. The moderator was Dr. Haroid Wcoster, Director of Information Services of the Air Force Office of Scientific Research.

[^1]:    2 In this connection, Professor Iosif Shilovsiky, Russia's greatest radio astrononder, tas the iollowing to say in the September 1965 issue of Soviet Lipe:
    "Profound crises lie in wait for a developing civilization and ose of them may well prove fatal. We are alreaciy familiar with several such critical (situations)
    (a) Self-destructiorras a result of a thermonuciear catastrophe or sacne ociber discovery which may have unpredictable and uncontrollable consequences.
    (b) Genetic danger-
    (c) Overproduction of informition:
    (d) Restricted capacity of the individual's brain which can lead to excessive specialization, with consequent dangers of degeneration.
    (e) A crisis precipitated by the creation of artificial intelligent beings."

[^2]:    'sy, Russia's greatest radio astronomer, ue of Societ Life:
    Hization and one of them may well prove criticad [situations]:
    sar catastrophe or some ocher discovery :ollabie consequences.

[^3]:    ${ }^{2}$ The Rosetta Stone is a piece of blac. of the Nile, bearing a bilingual inscription and Greek) with which Jean Francois Ch Esyptian hieroglyphs.

[^4]:    ${ }^{2}$ The Roseita Stone is a piece of black basalt found in 1799 near the Rosetta mouth of the Nile, bearing a bilingual inscription (in Egyptian hieroglyphics, Egyptian demootic, and Greek) with wjich Jean Fracgois Champollion was able to solve the mystery of the Egyptian hieroglyphs.

[^5]:    －The solution may be found on p．：
    s With what he has learmed fror reader formulate these two questions d compact formi the solutions appear on clessic unsolved problems in mathemati values of $x, y$ ，and $z$ can be found is an integer greater than 2；Goldbach＇s other mathematicians failed to make $t$ ： number greater than 2 can be expressed

[^6]:    －The solution may be found on p．109；but escisew the premature peek．
    ${ }^{3}$ With what be bas learned from this example of space communication，let the reader formulare these two quexions drectly for transmission to＂them，＂in a clea：and compact form；the solutions appear on pg．109．For the reader who is a little rusty on classic unsolved problems in matheratics，Fermat＇s Last Theorem stares that no integral values of $x, y$ ，and $z$ can be found to satisfy the equation $x^{n}+y^{\prime}=z^{n}$ ，if $n$ is an integer greater than 2；Goldbach＇s＂nötorious＂conjectiure（＂notonious＂only because other mathemacicians failed to make the conjecture themselves）states that every even number greater than 2 can be expersed as the sum of two primes．

